

Appendix A:

Research Methodology

1. Conduct Literature Review

The research team began the process by with an intensive literature review. The literature review process included compiling information into an annotated bibliography, which was completed in December and provided in the “Pre-Christmas Report.” Next the information was compiled into three categories:

“What is a Living Wage?”

“Opportunities for a Living Wage”

“Barriers to a Living Wage.”

The information from the annotated bibliography was then summarised in discursive text, which also followed the above three themes. This process of conducting a literature review helped to inform the case study development. The main findings are listed below. Please see **Section 2.0** for the full literature review, and **Appendix E** for the annotated bibliography and reference list.

2. Conduct Case Studies

The research team began the process of identifying three jurisdictions in Canada that had implemented living wage policies as was outlined in the initial proposal.

The first round of contacts was directed toward Social Planning Councils in targeted jurisdictions. Contacts included:

- Social Services Directors
- Economic Development Directors
- Chamber of Commerce Presidents
- Mayors

Correspondence with the cities on the contact list, provided in the **Appendix C**, did not yield anticipated results. Despite extensive research, no living wage policies were identified. Therefore the research team switched gears to study “sister” policies to living wages and examine their implications for Peterborough.

Three jurisdictions were identified as having “alternative policies to living wages”. The three jurisdictions that were identified were: Toronto, ON, Kamloops, BC (which is used as an example for a provincial policy), and Peterborough ON.

Case Study Research

- **Appendix D** contains original research and interview questions and final interview questions. The original research and interview questions were created in anticipation of analysis of Living Wage Policies, they served as templates for case study development on the recommended jurisdictions. The final interview questions were adapted by including reference to 'Fair Wage Policies' and included:
 - Outlining contours of the policy
 - Discussing problems and successes involved with pursuing a Fair Wage policy
 - Suggestions for further initiatives
- Team members consulted websites to find names and phone numbers of government officials, social planning councils, and city employees in their case study jurisdiction. This purposeful sampling led to initial contacts that either agreed to be interviewed or gave further contact information. Prior to telephone interviews, consent forms were signed and confidentiality was promised to allow our interview subjects to speak more freely. Interviews were taped and reviewed for clarification. Interview questions served as a guideline and discussion outside of questions was encouraged. Snowball references were obtained when each interviewee was asked to share additional contact information, articles and documents of relevance. The same interview procedure was used by Snowball references.
- Websites along with documentation and articles provided by interviewers provided the foundation of the case studies. Policies and reviews of the policy were most commonly used.
- Once finished, draft case studies were provided to focus group participants for one week of inspection and changes were incorporated into the final draft case study.

4. Focus Group Summary

The PSPC developed a list of possible focus group participants. The list included PSPC board members and reference group as well as community members from: Municipal Social Plan; Chamber of Commerce; Workforce Development Board; Peterborough & District Labour Council; Greater Peterborough Area Economic Development Corporation; Peterborough County-City Health Unit. Contacts were made by phone and email. A total of eight participants attended the focus group session on March 19, 2004 from 12:00 to 3:30. Team members framed the discussion by outlining key terms, presenting case study highlights and summarizing case study implications for Peterborough. The focus group participants were asked to identify potential barriers and opportunities to implementing a living wage in Peterborough. The focus group summary was developed by discussion points that were recorded on flip charts during focus group interaction. The results were then typed out verbatim along with expansion notes. The results were then categorized and interpreted.

5. Final Report

Corrections and changes were made to the draft case study reports based on the reference group's suggestions. Findings from the literature review and case studies were used to draw implications for Peterborough as is seen in **Section 6.0**. The results of the focus group are included in **Section 4.0**. The focus group participants' suggestions have also been incorporated into "Conclusions and Next Steps."

Appendix B:

Research Initiatives

Provided below is a brief reference list of those people and/or organizations that have been involved in research, or are knowledgeable about the topic of living wage.

CONTACT NAME	RELEVANCE
John Anderson Vice-President, Research Canadian Council on Social Development 309 Cooper St. / 5th Floor Ottawa, Ont. K2P 0G5 tel. 613-236 8977 ext. 244 e-mail anderson@ccsd.ca www.ccsd.ca	John Anderson has conducted extensive research in the field. To his knowledge, there is no living wage policy that exists in Canada. Anderson is interested in the outcome of this study and should prove to be an extremely helpful contact.

<p>Opportunities 2000 235 King Street East, Main Floor Kitchener, ON N2G 4N5 Phone: (519) 883-2353 Fax: (519) 568-8587 Email: op2000@lwdcoda.org Web: www.op2000.org Denise Wamsley (519-658-7946) d.wamsley@rogers.com</p>	<p>Denise Wamsley is involved in Opportunities 2000 which is an organization in Kitchener/Waterloo. Opportunities 2000 represents a network of community members whose goal is to reduce poverty. Wamsley and others are approaching issues of living wage implementation in the Waterloo region. Among other things, they have addressed local responses and concerns to living wages and have calculated the amount of the wage for Waterloo.</p>
<p>Stacy Luke DiLenardi Social Planning Council of Sudbury 30 Ste Anne Road, Suite 105 Sudbury, ON P3C 5E1 Phone: (705) 675-3894 Email: info@spcsudbury.ca Web: www.spcsudbury.ca</p>	<p>This social planning council, although not specifically conducting research on living wages, has written about the topic in a Social Indicators report which will soon be released. A copy of this section of the report was sent to the project team.</p>
<p>Dr. Chris Sarlo, Chair Nipissing University School of Business and Economics Email: chriss@nipissingu.ca</p>	<p>A professor at Nipissing Univeristy, Dr.Sarlo has researched living wage policies. As an economist, he has argued against the effectiveness of living wage policies.</p>

<p>Just Income Coalition 412 McDermot Ave. Winnipeg, MB R3A 0A9 Jean Altemeyer (204) 668-8160, ext. 30 Email: info@just-income.ca Web: www.just-income.ca</p>	<p>The Just Income Coalition is an organization situated in Winnipeg that lobbies for increased wages in Manitoba.</p>
<p>Duncan Cameron 12 Peter's Point Rd. Chelsea, Québec J9B 1L1 Phone: (819) 827-1098 Fax: (819) 827-2982</p>	<p>Duncan Cameron, a notable authority in the field, has published several works on the living wage. He has supplied information to the research team, and is interested in sharing his knowledge and results.</p>

Appendix C:

Jurisdiction Contact List

Contact Details

Provided here are the details for the jurisdictions the research team contacted when seeking living wage policies in Canada. The results from our contacts are listed below. Under “Jurisdiction” the name and contact information is listed. All cities are categorized according to province. If a Social Planning Council or city is undergoing research of their own, this information is listed under the “Research” category. “Initiators” refers to the operators of the research. Any related” or similar policies that were discovered taking place in these jurisdictions have been recorded under the “Nothing” category. Finally, if the contact requested a copy of the final document, this will be listed in the last box.

JURISDICTION	RESEARCH	INITIATORS	RELATED	NOTHING	REQUEST FINAL DOCUMENT
NEWFOUNDLAND					
St. John's Community Services Council Suite 201, Virginia Park Plaza St. John's, Newfoundland A1A 3E9 Contact: Penelope Rowe Tel. 709-753-9860 Fax. 709-753-6112 Email: pennyrowe@csc.nf.net				No policies.	

NEW BRUNSWICK				
<p>Moncton</p> <p>CITY HALL 655 Main St. Moncton New Brunswick Canada, E1C 1E8 Phone: 506 853-3333 E-mail: info.mayor@moncton.org Web: http://www.moncton.org/</p>				<p>No policies.</p>
<p>St. John</p> <p>Human Development Council P.O. Box 6125, Station A, Saint John, New Brunswick E2L 4R6 Tel. 506-634-1673 Fax. 506-636-8543 Email: hdc@nbnet.nb.ca</p>				<p>No success in contacting.</p>

QUEBEC				It should be noted that a language barrier exists since we are not sufficiently bilingual.
Brossard Borough of Brossard Resident Services 2001, boulevard Rome Brossard, Qc, J4W 3K5 Phone: (450) 463-7030 Fax: (450) 923-7046				No policies.
Hull E-mail: info@ville.gatineau.qc.ca				No policies.
LaSalle Borough of LaSalle 55, Dupras Avenue LaSalle (Québec) H8R 4A8 E-mail : communications@ville.lasalle.qc.ca Phone: (514) 367-1000				No policies.

<p>Longueuil</p> <p>www.longueuil.ca</p>				<p>No policies.</p>
<p>Repentigny</p> <p>Ville de Repentigny 435, boulevard Iberville, Repentigny, Québec, Canada, J6A 2B6 Téléphone : (450) 654-2323 Télécopieur : (450) 654-2421 communication@ville.repentigny.qc.ca</p>				<p>No policies.</p>
<p>Saint-Hubert</p> <p>Borough of Saint-Hubert Resident Services 5245, boulevard Cousineau Bureau 2000 Saint-Hubert, Qc, J3Y 7K8 Phone: (450) 463-7068 Fax: (450) 445-7650</p>				<p>No success in contacting.</p>

<p>Saint-Laurent</p> <p>Arrondissement de Saint-Laurent 777 boulevard Marcel-Laurin, Saint-Laurent (Québec) H4M 2M7 Tel. : (514) 855-6000 Fax : (514) 855-5709 EMail : saint-laurent@ville.montreal.qc.ca</p>				<p>No success in contacting.</p>
<p>Saint-Léonard</p> <p>Saint-Léonard Borough Office 8400 Lacordaire Blvd. Saint-Léonard, (Québec) H1R 3B1 Phone: (514) 328-8400 E-mail: bureau.st-leonard@ville.montreal.qc.ca</p>				<p>No policies.</p>
<p>Sherbrooke</p> <p>E-mail: DIRECTION.GENERALE@VILLE.SHERBRO OKE.QC.CA</p>				<p>No policies.</p>

ONTARIO				
<p>Ajax</p> <p>Social Development Council of Ajax-Pickering 134 Commercial Ave. Ajax, ON L1S 2H5 Contact: Colleen Jordan E-mail: socialdev@interhop.net Phone: 905-686-2661</p>				No policies.
<p>Brantford</p> <p>Brant Community SPC 110 Clarence St. S, Suite 105 Brantford, ON N3S 7N8 Contact: Caroline Ball E-mail: spc@bfree.on.ca</p>				No success in contacting.
<p>Caledon</p> <p>City of Caledon 6311 Old Church Rd, Caledon East, Ont. L0N 1E0 Phone #: 1-800-303-2546 Fax #: (905) 584-4325 Email: info@town.caledon.on.ca</p>				No success in contacting.

<p>Clarington</p> <p>Municipality of Clarington 40 Temperance Street Bowmanville, ON, Canada L1C 3A6 Phone: (800) 563-1195 E-mail: info@municipality.clarington.on.ca</p>				<p>No policies.</p>	
<p>Guelph</p> <p>Eden Grodzinski Community Services Director United Way Community Services of Guelph and Wellington 85 Westmount Rd., Guelph, ON, N1H 5J2 Tel: (519) 821-0571 Ext. 29 Fax: (519) 821-7847 eden@unitedwayguelph.com</p>				<p>No policies.</p>	
<p>Newmarket</p> <p>Town of Newmarket 395 Mulock Drive, P.O. Box 328 Newmarket, ON L3Y 4X7 Phone: 905-895-5193 E-mail: information@town.newmarket.on.ca</p>				<p>No policies.</p>	

<p>North Bay</p> <p>North Bay & Area SPC 183 First Ave. West North Bay, ON P1B 3B8 Contact: Lynn Ann Lauriault E-mail: nbsp@bellnet.ca Phone: 705-472-0200</p>				<p>No policies.</p>
<p>Pickering</p> <p>Ajax SPC same contact</p>				<p>See Ajax (same contact).</p>
<p>Sarnia</p> <p>City of Sarnia Community Services Department P.O. Box 3018 Sarnia, ON N7T 7N2 Contact: Terry McCallum Phone: (519) 332-0330 ext. 200 Fax: (519) 332-0776 Email: tmccallum@city.sarnia.on.ca</p>	<p>Research to be underway shortly. Committee chaired by City Manager. To study the positive and negative aspects of a fair wage law for the city. A report will be prepared for Council's consideration within the next three months.</p>	<p>Unsure. Could be the construction sector since the committee is chaired by 3 people affiliated.</p>		<p>No policies.</p>

<p>Sault Ste. Marie</p> <p>Algoma SPC 8 Albert St. East Sault Ste Marie, ON P6A 2H6</p> <p>Contact: Michael McFarling or Cheryl Linklater Phone: 705-253-3246 Alt.: 705-759-2554 ext. 549</p>				<p>No policies in place. Requires preliminary research to come up with a “cost of living” for SSM.</p>	
<p>Toronto</p> <p>City of Toronto</p> <p>http://www.city.toronto.on.ca/fairwage</p>			<p>Fair wage policies. Similar.</p>		
<p>Waterloo</p> <p>SPC of Kitchener-Waterloo 68 Queen St. North Kitchener, ON N2H 2H2</p> <p>Trudy Beaulne spckw@waterlooregion.org Phone: 519-579-3800</p>	<p>They are doing research on this. They have even calculated the amount that would constitute a living wage in Waterloo.</p>	<p>Opportunities 2000</p>		<p>No policies, but discussed implementing one. Interested in results of study.</p>	<p>Yes - Denise Wamsley</p>

<p>Whitby</p> <p>Town of Whitby 575 Rossland Road East Whitby, Ontario Canada L1N 2M8 Contact: Peter LeBel E-mail: ecdev@town.whitby.on.ca Phone: 905-430-4303 or 905-668-5803</p>				<p>No success in contacting.</p>	
<p>MANITOBA</p>					
<p>Brandon</p> <p>City of Brandon 410 9th Street Brandon, Manitoba R7A 6A2 Social Services Ph. (204) 729-2247 Fax. (204) 726-0058 http://www.city.brandon.mb.ca/</p>				<p>No policies. No research going on.</p>	

<p>Portage La Prairie</p> <p>City of Portage la Prairie Dept. of Economic and Community Development 97 Saskatchewan Avenue East Portage la Prairie, MB R1N 0L8 Phone: (204) 239-8334 Fax: (204) 239-1532 S. Dean Yaremchuk, Director Economic and Community Development dyaremchuk@city-plap.com http://www.city.portage-la-prairie.mb.ca/intro.html</p>				<p>No policies.</p>	
<p>Thompson</p> <p>ltaylor@city.thompson.mb.ca http://www.thompson.ca/cdps/cityinfo.cfm</p>				<p>No policies.</p>	

<p>Winnipeg</p> <p>Tara Rudy Policy Analyst Social Planning Council of Winnipeg Phone: 943-2561 ext 226 Fax: 942-3221 E-mail: tara@spcw.mb.ca Web: www.spcw.mb.ca</p> <p>City of Winnipeg 510 Main Street, Winnipeg, MB, R3B 1B9 City Hall Information/ Citizen Inquiry Service: 204-986-2171 (fax: 204-947-3452) http://www.winnipeg.ca/interhom/</p>	<p>Want to establish a minimum wage floor that provides a decent standard of living.</p>	<p>Just Income Coalition</p>		<p>No policies.</p>	<p>Yes - Tara Rudy, SPC of Winnipeg.</p>
<p>ALBERTA</p>					
<p>Edmonton</p> <p>Edmonton Social Planning Council #41-9912 106th Street Edmonton, Alberta T5K 1C5 Tel. 403-423-2031 Fax. 403-425-6244 Email: edmspc@interbaun.com</p>				<p>No policies.</p>	

<p>Lethbridge</p> <p>City of Lethbridge 910 - 4 Avenue South Lethbridge, Alberta Canada T1J 0P6 Contact: Terry Hartley General Manager, Human Resources City of Lethbridge (403) 329-7395 thartley@city.lethbridge.ab.ca</p>				<p>No policies.</p>	
<p>Medicine Hat</p> <p>City of Medicine Hat 580 - 1st Street SE Medicine Hat, AB T1A 8E6 Karen Charlton Manager of Social Development (403) 529-8314 karcha@medicinehat.ca</p>				<p>No policies. Anti-poor political climate.</p>	

<p>Red Deer</p> <p>Wendy Klassen Community Facilitator Social Planning Department City of Red Deer P.O. Box 5008 Red Deer, AB, Canada T4N 3T4 (403) 342-8102 (403) 342-8222 (FAX) wendyk@city.red-deer.ab.ca</p>				<p>No policies.</p>	<p>Yes</p>
<p>St. Albert</p> <p>The City of St. Albert St. Albert Place 5 St. Anne Street St. Albert, Alberta Canada T8N 3Z9 Phone: (780) 459-1500 Fax: (780) 460-2394 E-mail: information@st-albert.net Web: www.city.st-albert.ab.ca</p> <p>Audelle White Director, Family and Community Support Services awhite@St-Albert.net</p>				<p>No policies. Conservative political climate makes living wage implementation difficult.</p>	<p>Yes</p>

<p>Strathcona County</p> <p>Family and Community Services Strathcona County 21 Festival Way Sherwood Park, Alberta T8A 5T8 Canada Phone: (780) 464-4044 Fax: (780) 449-1220 E-mail: familyandcommunity@strathcona.ab.ca</p>				<p>No success in contacting.</p>	
<p>BRITISH COLUMBIA</p>					
<p>Chilliwack</p> <p>Chilliwick Social Research and Planning Council C/O UCFV 45635 Yale Rd. Chilliwack, BC V2P 6T4 Contact: Kevin Busswood e-mail: kevinbusswood@shaw.ca phone: (604) 824-9007</p>				<p>No success in contacting.</p>	

<p>Delta</p> <p>Coporation of Delta - Community Services Advisory Committee</p> <p>4450 Clarence Taylor Cres.</p> <p>Delta, BC</p> <p>V4K 3E2</p> <p>Contact: Rosemary Zelinka</p> <p>Senior Planner</p> <p>RZelinka@corp.delta.bc.ca</p> <p>Phone: (604) 946-3355</p>				<p>No policies. Have considered living or fair wage policies in the past but have not acted upon them.</p>	
<p>Kamloops</p> <p>Mayor Mel Rothenburger</p> <p>Mayor@kamloops.ca</p> <p>City of Kamloops - Social Planning Council</p> <p>7 Victoria St. West</p> <p>Kamloops, BC</p> <p>V2C 1A2</p> <p>Contact: Ron McColl (Recreation and Culture Manager)</p> <p>E-mail: rmccoll@city.kamloops.bc.ca</p> <p>Phone: (250) 828-3465</p>			<p>The city did have a fair wage; but no longer exists because provincial government legislation changed and fair wage not considered useful.</p>	<p>Mayor said that they had none. See related.</p>	

<p>Kelowna</p> <p>City of Kelowna - Purchasing Department 1435 Water St. Kelowna, BC V1Y 1J4 E-mail: ask@city.kelowna.bc.ca Phone: (250) 862-3339</p>				<p>No policies.</p>
<p>Langley</p> <p>Langley Family Services Association 5339 207th St. Langley, BC V3A 2E6 Contact: Lynda Brummitt E-mail: lfs@uniserve.com Phone: (604) 534-7921</p>				<p>No policies. Says the provincial government is in charge of that.</p>
<p>Maple Ridge</p> <p>Maple Ridge/Pitt Meadows Community Services 11907 228th St. Maple Ridge, BC V2X 8G8 Contact: Herb Van Home E-mail: hvanhome@comservice.bc.ca Phone: (604) 467-6911 (wk #)</p>				<p>No policies.</p>

<p>Nanaimo</p> <p>City of Nanaimo - Social Planning Advisory Committee</p> <p>455 Wallace St.</p> <p>Nanaimo, BC</p> <p>V9R 5J6</p> <p>Contact: Alison Millward (Social Planner)</p> <p>E-mail: amillwar@city.nanaimo.bc.ca</p> <p>Phone: (250) 755-4483</p>			<p>Fair Wage Skills Development Act (Provincial)</p>		
<p>New Westminister</p> <p>New Westminister Community Development Society</p> <p>713 Columbia St. (main floor)</p> <p>New Westminister, BC</p> <p>V3M 1B2</p> <p>Contact: Vicki Austad</p> <p>E-mail: vaustad@newwestced.bc.ca</p> <p>Phone: (604) 517-6150 (Wk#)</p>				<p>No success in contacting.</p>	
<p>North Vancouver</p> <p>North Shore Community Resource Society</p> <p>Capilano Mall, #204-935 Marine Dr.</p> <p>North Vancouver, BC</p> <p>V7P 1S3</p> <p>Contact: Li Boeson</p> <p>E-mail: nscirs@vcn.bc.ca</p> <p>Phone: (604) 985-7138 (Wk#)</p>				<p>No policies.</p>	<p>Yes.</p>

<p>Port Coquitlam</p> <p>Society for Community Development (Tri-Cities)</p> <p>500 Lougheed Hwy Fernwood Lodge, Holly Dr. Coquitlam, BC V3C 4J2</p> <p>Contact: Cheryl McKeever E-mail scd@smarrt.com Phone: (604) 777-2394 (Wk#)</p>				<p>No success in contacting.</p>	
<p>Victoria</p> <p>Jane Worton Researcher, Community Council Phone: 250-383-5433 www.qolchallenge.ca</p> <p>Community Social Planning Council of Greater Victoria 1144 Fort Street Victoria, B.C. V8V 3K8 Tel. 250-383-6166 Fax: 250-385-6712 Email: cspc@islandnet.com</p>	<p>Sustainable Incomes – priority area of Quality of Life Challenge initiative. Working to raise awareness about working poor with business sector.</p>			<p>No policies.</p>	<p>Yes - Jane Worton</p>

NORTH WEST TERRITORIES					
Yellowknife Lyda Fuller lydafuller@yellowknife.ywca.ca Suzette Montreuil Alternatives North suzette@hotmai.com				No policies.	

Appendix D: Research and Interview Questions

The following questions were modified depending on the interview subject and tailored to that person's knowledge.

Dimension One: How are fair wage policies structured and enacted?

Interview questions

What instruments are used to enact 'fair wage' policies (i.e., ordinances, voluntary participation, bylaws, et cetera.)?
 Can I get a copy of the documents that contain 'fair wage' policy including any discussion papers, bylaws or municipal ordinances?
 Which employees are covered by it?
 How much is paid as a 'fair wage'?
 How was the 'fair wage' level determined?

Dimension Two: Who is affected by 'fair wage policies' and in what way?

Interview questions

Who benefits from the fair wage ordinance?
 How many workers and/or families have been affected by the implementation of a fair wage?
 In what types of families do fair wage earners live? Are the workers single or married? Are they the sole-earners in their family or one of many?
 What percentage of the "beneficiaries" are single adults, with no dependants?

Dimension Three: How effective are fair wage policies?

Interview questions

What has been the response of community members since the fair wage was implemented?
 What were the main driving factors that led to pursuit of fair wage policies?
 Who were the main community actors behind the initiative?
 What (if any) were the main points and sources of resistance to policy development and implementation?
 What problems have been encountered since the implementation of the fair wage?
 How is the fair wage enforced?
 What has been the overall effect of the ordinance?

Appendix E:

Reference List (Alphabetical)

- Bartik, T. (2002). Thinking about local living wage requirements. Upjohn Institute Staff Working Paper, W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research
- Battle, K. (2003, February). Ontario's shrinking minimum wage. Caledon Institute of Social Policy, 1-3.
- Battle, K. (2003, January). Minimum wages in Canada: A statistical portrait with policy implementations. Caledon Institute of Social Policy. [Journal article on-line]. Retrieved February 24, 2003, from the World Wide Web:
<http://www.caledoninst.org/Abstracts/MinWage.htm>
- Bernstein, J., Boushey, H., and Rasell, E. (2001). Set up, not out: The case for raising the federal minimum wage for workers in every state. EPI Issue Brief, #149. Washington DC: Economic Policy Institute.
- Berenstein, J. (2000). The living wage movement: pointing the way to the high road. Washington, DC: Economic Policy Institute. Retrieved from the World Wide Web:
http://www.epinet.org/content.cfm/externalpubs_lwmovement
- Brown, A. & Stanford, J. (2000). Flying Without a Net: The Economic Freedom of Working Canadians in 2000.
- Cameron, D. (2003). Making a Living: Mounting a Living Wage Movement in Canada. Canadian Social Welfare Policy Conference.
- Collins, C., Kraut, K., and Klinger, S. (2000). Choosing the high road: Business that pay a living wage a prosper. Responsible Wealth: a Project of United For a Fair Economy.

Retrieved from the World Wide Web:

http://www.responsiblewealth.org/living_wage/Living_Wage_Report.pdf

deGroot-Maggetti, G. (2002). A measure of poverty in Canada: a guide to the debate about poverty lines. Public Justice Resource Centre.

Economic Policy Institute. (no date). Living wage: Facts at a glance. Retrieved February 26, 2001, from the World Wide Web:

<http://www.epinet.org/Issueguides/livingwage/livingwagefacts.html>

The Fraser Institute. (June 9, 2003). A New Look at Poverty in Canada. Retrieved from the World Wide Web: <http://www.fraserintitute.ca/canstats/readmore.asp?sNav=pb&id=538>

Galt, V. (2003, November 14). Poor pay, poor jobs. The Globe and Mail, p.C1.

Gervasi, L. (2000, June). Fair Wage Policy. City of Toronto, Corporate Services, Fair Wage and Labour Trades Office. Available from: City of Toronto via the internet;

<http://www.city.toronto.on.ca/fairwage>

Government of Canada (2003). Canada Labour Laws. Human Resources Development Canada. Retrieved from the World Wide Web: <http://www.hrhc-drhc.gc.ca>

Government of Canada (2003). Employment Standards Fact Sheet. Ministry of Ontario.

Retrieved February 2 2004 from the World Wide Web:

http://www.gov.on.ca/LAB/english/es/factsheets/fs_wage.html

Human Resources Development Canada (May, 2003). Applied Research Branch Strategic Policy. Understanding the 2000 Low Market Income Statistics Based on the Market Basket Measure. Retrieved from the World Wide Web:<http://www.drhc-hrhc.gc.ca>

- Jackson, A. (2003, April 7). Living wage repays society in the end. The National Post.
- Jackson, A., Robinson, D., Baldwin, B., Wiggins, C. (2000). Falling Behind: The State of Working in Canada.
- Luce, S. (2002, spring/summer). Life Support: Coalition Building and the Living Wage Movement. New York: New Labor Forum.
- Martin, J. (no date). Earning a Living Wage in Peterborough. Unpublished report, Peterborough Social Planning Council, Peterborough, ON.
- Maxwell, J. (2002). Working for Low Pay. Presentation: Canadian Policy Research Networks to Alberta Human Resources and Employment.
- Hon. McCain, M. N., Mustard, F. J., (1999). Reversing the Real Brain Drain; Early Years Study Final Report. Publications Ontario.
- Neumark, D. (2002). How living wage laws affect low wage workers and low income families. San Francisco: Public Policy Institute of California. Retrieved November 25 2003 from The World Wide Web: http://www.ppic.org/content/pubs/R_302DNR.pdf.
- Quigley, W. (no date). Full-time workers should not be poor: The living wage movement. P. 1-36.
- Reynolds, D. (2003, January). An Activist's Guide to Building the Movement for Economic Justice. ACORN National Living Wage Resource Centre and Labour Studies Centre, Wayne State University.
- Robinson, D. (2002). State of the Economy. Canadian Centre For Policy Alternatives, Vo. 2, No. 1.

Rutakumwa, W. (2002). Poverty as a Public Policy Problem in Canada: An Analysis and Critique of the Competing Policy Arguments. Crossing Boundaries-an interdisciplinary journal, 1, (2), 38-48.

Schenk, C. (2001). From Poverty Wages to a Living Wage. Toronto: CSJ foundation for research and education, Ontario Federation of Labour.

Shannon, M. T., and Beach, C. M. (1995). Distributional employment effects of Ontario minimum-wage proposals: a microdata approach. Canadian Public Policy, 11, 3, 284-303.

Standford, J. (2003, June). Ontario: Way behind the times. Canadian Auto Workers.

Stanford, J. (1999). Economic Freedom (for the Rest of Us). Economist, Canadian Auto Workers Visiting Fellow, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives.

Varricchione, L. (2001). Issues and Options: Living Wage Ordinances. Municipal Reference Service.

Annotated Bibliography (Thematic)

What is a Living Wage?

1. deGroot-Maggetti, G. (2002). A measure of poverty in Canada: a guide to the debate about poverty lines. Public Justice Resource Centre.

This article discusses how poverty is measured in Canada and the varying views of what should be included in this measure. Various frameworks are presented and followed by a discussion on the arbitrary decisions that are made when creating a poverty line.

2. Economic Policy Institute. (no date). Living wage: Facts at a glance. Retrieved February 26, 2001, from the World Wide Web:
<http://www.epinet.org/Issueguides/livingwage/livingwagefacts.html>

This website provides information on living wage ordinances in categories such as localities, raises for low-income workers, pay for contractual workers, economic development policies, contracting processes, and job losses. These categories are all examined according to how they have been affected by living wage ordinances.

3. The Fraser Institute June 9, 2003. A New Look at Poverty in Canada. Retrieved from the World Wide Web:
<http://www.fraserinstitute.ca/canstats/readmore.asp?sNav=pb&id=538>

This gives a critical review of the Market Basket Measure. An opinion about how the media handled the new information reporting the use of the Market Basket Measure indicates an increase in the number of people in poverty. The media is criticized as they have seemingly decided not to report the increasing problem. Another criticism is that the media has done a poor job telling its readers how the poverty measure would be used. In addition, some argue that after-tax income levels should have been reported, as opposed to the before-income tax levels.

4. Gervasi, L. (2000, June). Fair Wage Policy. City of Toronto, Corporate Services, Fair Wage and Labour Trades Office. Available from: City of Toronto via the internet;
<http://www.city.toronto.on.ca/fairwage>

This policy includes the purposes of a fair wage policy. It provides definitions for terms such as Field Work, Shop Work, Workers, Fair Wage Schedule, and Fringe Benefits. It includes the policy and provisions that have been implemented in the city of Toronto.

5. Martin, J. (no date). Earning a Living Wage in Peterborough. Unpublished report,

Peterborough Social Planning Council, Peterborough, ON.

This unpublished report discusses living wage legislation and provides four case studies of cities in the US that have implemented living wages. It provides information into what a living wage is, why it is important, and how it can be implemented.

6. Understanding the 2000 Low Market Income Statistics Based on the Market Basket Measure. Applied Research Branch Strategic Policy, Human Resources Development Canada (May, 2003). Retrieved from the World Wide Web:<http://www.drhc-hrhc.gc.ca>

This paper explains in detail the basis of developing a Market Basket Measure, a new tool used to assess low income.

Opportunities for a Living Wage

1. Battle, K. (2003, January). Minimum wages in Canada: A statistical portrait with policy implementations. Caledon Institute of Social Policy. [Journal article on-line]. Retrieved February 24, 2003, from the World Wide Web:
<http://www.caledoninst.org/Abstracts/MinWage.htm>

This study examines the minimum wages within each of Canada's provinces and territories, as well as the national average. It investigates the key characteristics of the minimum wage workforce. It compares Canada's minimum wages with the US and other industrialized nations. It also discusses the debate over minimum wage levels.

2. Battle, K. (2003, February). Ontario's shrinking minimum wage. Caledon Institute of Social Policy, 1-3.

This commentary examines the decreasing value of Ontario's minimum wage. It looks at Ontario's minimum wage in relation to the other Canadian provinces and US states.

This commentary investigates the average earnings of workers in Ontario in relation to the poverty line. It suggests that modest increases are essential.

3. Bernstein, J., Boushey, H., and Rasell, E. (2001). Set up, not out: The case for raising the federal minimum wage for workers in every state. EPI Issue Brief, #149. Washington DC: Economic Policy Institute.

This article argues that US Congress should implement a mandatory federal minimum wage across the country. In making the case for this, the authors explain who will benefit from the raise (women, ethnic minorities) and argues that the raises won't hurt the economy's growth or cause significant unemployment, even in times of recession.

4. Berenstein, J. (2000). The living wage movement: pointing the way to the high road. Washington, DC: Economic Policy Institute. Retrieved from the World Wide Web: http://www.epinet.org/content.cfm/externalpubs_lwmovement

This article argues for the implementation of living wages. It addresses the concerns of businesses and economists and discusses why these concerns and theories may be invalid when applied to this issue.

5. Brown, A. & Stanford, J. (2000). Flying Without a Net: The Economic Freedom of Working Canadians in 2000.

This paper develops a quantitative index of the well-being of Canadian workers. Called the Economic Freedom (For the Rest of Us) Index - EFRU, for short - this index confirms that formal labour market indicators in Canada, such as the unemployment rate and real earnings, have now fully recovered to pre-recession levels. Most of that improvement occurred in the last two years, driven by strong economic growth and job creation. These gains, however, have been tempered by a decline in recent years in the various income supports and social protections which also contribute to the real economic welfare of most Canadians. Budget cutbacks and deregulation in the late

1990s dramatically reduced the extent to which these various programs supplement workers' private labour market earnings.

6. Cameron, D. (2003). Making a Living: Mounting a Living Wage Movement in Canada. Canadian Social Welfare Policy Conference.

Duncan Cameron's well-renowned paper "Making a Living" examines the objectives behind living wages and presents a model for the Ottawa area. This document offers thoughtful criticism on why a living wage is important and how it can be made to work.

7. Collins, C., Kraut, K., and Klinger, S. (2000). Choosing the high road: Business that pay a living wage a prosper. Responsible Wealth: a Project of United For a Fair Economy. Retrieved from the World Wide Web:
http://www.responsiblewealth.org/living_wage/Living_Wage_Report.pdf

This article first gives reasons for why a living wage is important, explaining why full time workers can still live in poverty, and how and why minimum wages can be insufficient. Next it discusses the business benefits of living wages and then responds to the common concerns of businesses over living wages (e.g. inflation, slowed economic growth, increased unemployment, increased competitiveness and decreased investment). It also profiles successful businesses who use living wages.

8. Galt, V. (2003, November 14). Poor pay, poor jobs. The Globe and Mail, p.C1.

This article discusses the problem of non-standard employment, and the vulnerability of the working poor. It also makes reference to some of the potential strategies that can be used to reduce the vulnerability of non-standard employees while allowing economic competitiveness and productivity to remain strong.

9. Jackson, A. (2003, April 7). Living wage repays society in the end. The National Post.

This newspaper article speaks of what the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) defines as a low wage and provides statistics on low-wage workers. Many of the working poor were found to be women, recent immigrants, and those with limited formal education. It examines what is being done in other countries and provinces in relation to Ontario.

10. Jackson, A., Robinson, D., Baldwin, B., Wiggins, C. (2000). Falling Behind: The State of Working in Canada.

A press release, highlights of the book and the first chapter are available on line at <http://www.policyalternatives.ca/publications/pub3.html>. This article surmises facts that are relevant to living wage. For example:

There has been no increase for more than 20 years in the real annual earnings of Canadian men working full-time.

Average weekly earnings, adjusted for inflation, grew just 2.8% from 1989 to 1998. And, despite strong economic growth in 1999, there was no increase in real weekly earnings.

The average after-tax and after-transfer income of Canadians fell by 5.6% over the 1990s, with poorer families experiencing a decline of 12%.

11. Luce, S. (2002, spring/summer). Life Support: Coalition Building and the Living Wage Movement. New York: New Labour Forum.

Although American based, this paper provides valuable information about the living wage campaign. It explains what a living wage entails, and details the complex relationship living wages have to unions. It provides many examples of ways in which living wages have been implemented in the U.S. and the challenges they have encountered.

12. Maxwell, J. (2002). Working for Low Pay. Presentation: Canadian Policy Research Networks to Alberta Human Resources and Employment.

This PowerPoint presentation is very informative and includes Canadian statistics as well as comparisons of Alberta and Ontario. For example, graphs illustrate Real Minimum Wages, the index of Real Annual Earnings of Paid Male Workers, Characteristics of Low-Wage Workers in Alberta and Canada, employment and unemployment rates of men and women (1976-2001).

Three key policy questions are addressed.

1. What are the consequences of low paid work?
2. Who should take responsibility for these consequences?
3. What policy options should be considered?

13. Hon. McCain, M. N., Mustard, F. J., (1999). Reversing the Real Brain Drain; Early Years Study Final Report. Publications Ontario.

How well society is coping with technological change and the resulting impact on real annual wages is discussed by viewing the major economic effects on the young and families with children.

14. Quigley, W. (no date). Full-time workers should not be poor: The living wage movement. P. 1-36.

This report is trying to bring justice to a local living wage movement. It provides history, calculations, definitions, and state wage laws of the living wage from a US perspective. It provides an excellent insight into the opposition and future issues for the living wage movement.

15. Reynolds, D. (2003, January). An Activist's Guide to Building the Movement for Economic Justice. ACORN National Living Wage Resource Centre and Labour Studies Centre, Wayne State University.

This extensive activist's manual provides information on how to build a living wage

movement. It is extremely thorough, covering all the important factors in campaigning, organizing and implementing a living wage. It references examples from all over the US.

16. Rutakumwa, W. (2002). Poverty as a Public Policy Problem in Canada: An Analysis and Critique of the Competing Policy Arguments. Crossing Boundaries-an interdisciplinary journal, 1, (2), 38-48.

The paper presents four models outlining the competing policy arguments of the different policy actors. The Canadian government, the official federal opposition party, and the Fraser Institute arguments are analyzed and relevant policies are recommended.

17. Schenk, C. (2001). From Poverty Wages to a Living Wage. Toronto: CSJ foundation for research and education, Ontario Federation of Labour.

This booklet disputes some of the common myths about living wages, and provides up to date information on who is affected by minimum wage changes, in addition to discussing the benefits that come from securing partnerships with unions. This booklet has been especially helpful to the group in that it discusses fair wage policies in Ontario.

18. Stanford, J. (2003, June). Ontario: Way behind the times. Canadian Auto Workers.

This report examines Ontario's minimum wages and poverty line compared to other provinces. Ontario's minimum wage was last increased in January of 1995, indicating the longest freeze of minimum wage levels by any province in Canada. This report provides many of the basic facts and key issues of the minimum wage in Ontario.

19. Stanford, J. (1999). Economic Freedom (for the Rest of Us). Economist, Canadian Auto Workers Visiting Fellow, Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives.

This paper begins with a background questioning economic freedom. It explains that economic freedom is an ideological concept - one that is not relevant to those in lowest economic status. The paper then explains who will benefit the most from economic freedom: the financially wealthy. An index of Economic Freedom (for the Rest of Us) Index (EFRU index) is presented. The EFRU measures the impact of government policies, rules and institutions on the economic prospects of those members of society who must work for a living wage.

20. Varricchione, L. (2001). Issues and Options: Living Wage Ordinances. Municipal Reference Service.

This article begins with a reprinted article (Nations Cities Weekly: July 2, 2001 vol. 24, no.26) that describes Living Wage ordinances, defines key terms and makes reference to current scholarly work explaining that poverty of working families can only be overcome by tireless efforts of the living wage. The author first argues that “full time workers should not be poor” and then focuses on arguments for and against Living Wage Ordinances (LWO). Next it reviews cities that have enacted LWO's, describing them in detail. The most valuable information in this article is the positive and negative aspects of a LWO and a list of questions to consider when developing LWO.

Barriers to a Living Wage

1. Bartik, T. (2002). Thinking about local living wage requirements. Upjohn Institute Staff Working Paper, W.E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research.

This paper critically examines the negative effects of living wages. The author argues that while living wages applied to city contract workers may have positive effects, those applied to non-city funded workers or those applied to economic development assistance programs where the economy is weak can have more detrimental effects.

2. Neumark, D. (2002). How living wage laws affect low wage workers and low income

families. San Francisco: Public Policy Institute of California. Retrieved November 25 2003 from The World Wide Web:
http://www.ppic.org/content/pubs/R_302DNR.pdf.

In this research study David Neumark critically examines how living wage policies have been implemented across the US. He specifically looks at how effective living wages are in lifting families out of poverty, and whether the benefit of higher wages is offset by higher unemployment. Ultimately he finds that living wages are helpful in raising wages and lifting people out of poverty, but that some unemployment does occur, and that living wages, while somewhat successful, are not necessarily the single best option for decreasing poverty.

3. Robinson, D. (2002). State of the Economy. Canadian Centre For Policy Alternatives, Vo. 2, No. 1.

This article reviews policy alternatives from a business perspective explaining how real wage increases are inline with productivity growth and raising rates at this time would risk cutting short the current recovery. Key issues facing the Canadian economy are discussed and estimate projections are reported. The final point of the report suggests the social infrastructure is in urgent need of repair.

4. Shannon, M. T., and Beach, C. M. (1995). Distributional employment effects of Ontario minimum-wage proposals: a microdata approach. Canadian Public Policy, 11, 3, 284-303.

This article examines the potential employment losses if the Ontario minimum wage was increased by 60% from the current minimum wage. It suggests that the majority of workers who would be affected by this change would be females, youth, part-time workers, families with low earnings, workers with less than a high school education, and those working in Retail and Accommodation and Food industries. However, more men would be affected by the average cost gap. The policy that is examined would reduce the number of jobs by 73-92 thousand.

Appendix F:

Reference List: Case Studies

Akyeampong, Ernest B (1989). *Working for a Minimum Wage*. Perspectives On Labour and Income, vol. 1, no. 3. Toronto: Ontario Ministry of Labour. Retrieved March 12, 2004 from the World Wide Web: <http://www.statcan.ca/english/studies/75-001/archive/1989/pear1989001003s4a01.pdf>

Anonymous Interview A. (2004, February 24). *Employee of Toronto Fair Wage Office*.

Anonymous Interview B. (2004, February 25). *Employee, B.C. Skills Development and Labour*.

Anonymous Interview C. (2004, March 5). *Employee, B.C. Skills Development and Labour*.

Anonymous Interview D. (2004, January 30). *City of Kamloops Employee*.

Anonymous Interview E. (2004, March 3). *City of Peterborough Employee*.

Anonymous Interview F. (2004, March 11). *Representative from Peterborough and District Labour Council*.

Canadian Council on Social Development. (2004). *Before-Tax Low-Income Cut-Offs (LICOs), 2003*. Ottawa, ON: CCSD. Retrieved March 31, 2004 from the World Wide Web: <http://www.ccsd.ca/facts.html>

CanadaOne. (2004). *Ask-an-Expert: Minimum Wage Rewind*. Gormley, ON: CanadaOne. Retrieved March 11, 2004 from the World Wide Web: http://www.canadaone.com/ezine/expert/feb02/minimum_wage.html

Canada- Ontario Business Service Centre (COBSC). *A Supplier's Guide to the City of Toronto*. (n.d.). Retrieved March 2, 2004, from the World Wide Web:
<http://www.enterprisetoronto.com/supplier.html>.

City of Toronto (n.d.). *Industry Profile*. [Web page]. Retrieved February 24, 2004, from the World Wide Web: http://www.city.toronto.on.ca/economic_profile/industry_profiles.htm

City of Toronto. (2001). *Request for Proposal*. [Web page]. Retrieved February 25, 2004, from the World Wide Web:http://www.city.Toronto.on.ca/tenders/economic_irishrovers.htm.

City of Toronto: Fair Wage Office. (2004). *Previous Policies and Schedules*. [Web page]. Retrieved February 23, 2004, from the World Wide Web:
http://www.city.toronto.on.ca/fairwage/previous_policy_schedules.htm.

City of Toronto: Fair Wage Office. (2003, May). *Follow-up Review*. Toronto Staff Report.

City of Toronto: Fair Wage Office. (2001). *Fair Wage Policy*. Toronto, ON. 4p.

City of Toronto: Mayor David Miller. (2003). *Human Rights Day Speech*. Retrieved March 1, 2004, from the World Wide Web:
http://www.city.toronto.on.ca/mayor_miller/speeches/human_rights_day_121003.htm.

The Corporation of the City of Peterborough (date unknown). *Request for Quote Sample*. Peterborough, ON: Corporation of the City of Peterborough.

The Corporation of the City of Peterborough (1987). *By-Law Number 1987-96*. Peterborough, ON: Corporation of the City of Peterborough.

The Corporation of the City of Peterborough (1963). *By-Law Number 1963-102*.

Peterborough, ON: Corporation of the City of Peterborough.

Employment Standards Branch (1999). *A Guide to the Skills Development and*

Fair Wage Act of British Columbia. Ministry of Labour/Employment Standards Branch.

Government of Canada (1997). *The Impact of Skills Development and Fair Wage*

Policy on Construction Costs In British Columbia: An Empirical Analysis of Some Key Issues.

Ministry of Labour, (2003) Minimum Wage Rates: B.C. Ministry of Skills

Development and Labour.

Ontario Ministry of Labour. (2004, January). *Employment Standards Fact Sheet*

- *Minimum Wage*. [Web page] Retrieved March 3, 2004 from the World Wide Web:
http://www.gov.on.ca/LAB/english/es/factsheets/fs_wage.html.

Ontario Ministry of Labour (2003). *McGuinty government raises minimum wage,*

helps lowest-paid workers. Toronto, ON: Ministry of Labour. Retrieved March 12, 2004
from the World Wide Web:

http://ogov.newswire.ca/ontario/GPOE/2003/12/01/c8269.html?lmatch=&lang=_e.html

Openmind (1995). *The Fairness Myth*. Retrieved Feb 18 from the World Wide

Web: <http://www.meritalberta.com/publications/fairnessmyth.pdf>

Statistics Canada (2004a). *2001 Census*. Retrieved March 3, 2004 from the

World Wide Web: <http://www12.statcan.ca/english/census01/home/index.cfm>

Statistics Canada (2004b). *1996 Census*. Retrieved March 3, 2004 from the World Wide Web: <http://www12.statcan.ca/english/census01/info/census96.cfm>

Statistics Canada (2004c). *E-Stat*. Retrieved March 9, 2004 from the World Wide Web: <http://estat.statcan.ca/content/english/over.shtml>

Statistics Canada (2004d). *E-Stat*. Retrieved March 12, 2004 from the World Wide Web: <http://estat.statcan.ca/content/english/over.shtml>

Statistics Canada (2004e). 2001 Census Dictionary. *Low Income Cut-offs*. Retrieved March 3, 2004 from the World Wide Web: <http://www.statcan.ca/english/census2001/dict/fam021.htm>

Statistics Canada (2004f). *E-Stat*. Retrieved April 8, 2004 from the World Wide Web: <http://estat.statcan.ca/cgi-win/CNSMCGI.exe>

Statistics Canada (2001). Community Profile-Kamloops. *Income and Work Statistics, 2001*. Retrieved from the World Wide Web on March 5, 2004: <http://www12.statca.ca/english/Profil/Details/details1inc.cfm?SEARCH=BEGINS&PSGC>.

..

Venture Kamloops (2004). *1996 Kamloops Community Profile*. Thompson-Nicola Tourism & Economic Development Society. Retrieved from the World Wide Web on Feb 16, 2004: <http://www.venturekamloops.com/Pages/kamloops.htm>

Appendix G:

Glossary

Living Wage

The purpose of a living wage is to help lift the working poor out of poverty. A living wage is a wage floor that is calculated based on the local cost of living and is set high enough to support employees and their families. Living wages usually only apply to businesses with City contracts that fulfil specific criteria. Sometimes the affected businesses receive government subsidies or tax breaks.

Fair Wage

Fair wages are municipally set wage standards for particular kinds of jobs, such as construction work. The wage level is set according to union rates and are based on union contracts.

Prevailing Wage

This term refers to the average or model wage in a particular jurisdiction. The average wage is always below the union rate.

Minimum Wage

A minimum wage is the lowest wage an employee can be paid. They are provincially set, except for selected industries which have their minimum wages federally mandated.

Temporary Labour Rate

The temporary labour rate refers to the lowest union wage found in the Local 504, CUPE collective bargaining agreement with the City of Peterborough. This is intended for unionized manual labourers with no vehicle operation responsibilities (Anonymous E, 2004). This is the “fair minimum wage” specified in By-Law Number 1987-96 (The Corporation of the City of Peterborough, 1987).